

Bouchard Transportation Co., Inc.

58 South Service Road, Suite 150
Melville, New York 11747
Tel.: (631) 390-4900
Fax: (631) 390-4905

ATLANTIC COAST • LONG ISLAND SOUND
GREAT LAKES • GULF COAST

March 18, 2004

Capt. Mary Landry
Commanding Officer
USCG Marine Safety Office
20 Risho Ave.
East Providence, RI 02914-1208

Re: B 120 Cargo Loss/February 3, 2004 Letter from Joseph E. Costa

Dear Captain Landry:

Dr. Joseph Costa, in his capacity as a trustee representative in the B 120 natural resource damage assessment process (as a member of the Technical Working Group on Aquatic Injury), sent to you on February 3, 2004 a report entitled "An interim analysis of the June 14, 2003 report by Independent Maritime Consulting on the volume of oil Spilled by the Bouchard Transportation Company tank barge *Bouchard No. 120* in Buzzards Bay." As you recall Bouchard Transportation appointed Independent Maritime Consulting, Ltd. (IMC) to review the available cargo surveys and data and to provide a comprehensive, independent estimate of the cargo loss. The IMC report was sent to Cmdr. Little on June 16, 2003.

Upon receipt of Dr. Costa's report, we asked IMC to perform an independent assessment of Dr. Costa's report. In order to provide additional assurances to the regulatory agencies and to the public, we also directed the firm of cargo experts, Minton, Trehane & Davies (USA), Inc. (MT&D) of Kingwood, Texas to review and opine on IMC's original report, Dr. Costa's report, and IMC's response. The IMC response to Dr. Costa's report and MT&D's letter concurring in IMC's analysis and conclusions are attached.

As you can see from the IMC response, Capt. Hall decided not to provide a point by point rebuttal of Dr. Costa's report. Instead, he responded to Dr. Costa's principal concern that the amount of oil reported to have been recovered at Caddell's yard was overstated and that as a consequence the estimated volume of oil spilled into the Bay was understated. I draw your attention to IMC's analysis of the cargo clingage on the vertical surfaces of the B 120 and B 10 tanks, which were not factored into Dr. Costa's analysis. As you will see, accounting for the clingage of oil on vertical surfaces in the tanks of the two barges addresses Dr. Costa's primary concern about the amount of oil recovered at Caddell's yard.

I encourage you to contact Capt. Hall or Denis McGrath if you have any further questions.

Very truly yours,


Stan Chelluck
Chief Operating Officer

Attachments